

CARSON CITY HISTORIC ARCHITECTURE REVIEW COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 15, 2001 Meeting

Page 1

A regular meeting of the Carson City Historic Architecture Review Commission was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, May 15, 2001 in the City Hall Capitol Conference Room, 201 North Carson Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Richard Baker
Rebecca Ossa
Peter Smith

ALSO PRESENT:
Robert Darney

STAFF: Jennifer Pruitt, Assistant Planner
Kathleen King, Recording Secretary
(HARC 05/15/01)

NOTE: Unless indicated otherwise, each item was introduced by Chairperson Drews. A tape recording of these proceedings is on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office and is available for review and inspection during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (1-0001) - Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo and Commissioner Speulda were absent.

B. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - APRIL 10, 2001 AND APRIL 19, 2001 (1-0007) - Commissioner Ossa moved to approve the April 19, 2001 minutes. Commissioner Baker seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0. Commissioner Smith moved to approve the April 10, 2001 minutes. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

C. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (1-0019) - None.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTS (1-0025) - None.

E. DISCLOSURES (1-0031) - None.

F. PUBLIC HEARINGS: ACTION ITEMS

F-1. H-00/01-15 A REQUEST FROM DARREN SELBY, PROPERTY OWNER AND APPLICANT, FOR HISTORIC TAX DEFERMENT ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 709 SOUTH MINNESOTA STREET, APN 3-106-03 (1-0035) - Chairperson Drews referred to staff's recommended motion included in the agenda materials and reviewed historic tax deferral criteria for the benefit of Mr. Darney. Mr. Selby responded to questions regarding the location of his property, the previous owner, the age of the house, and additions to the structure over the years. He advised that the Historic Survey contains photographs and information about the existing structure. He acknowledged that his house is not included in the Carson City Historic District and, in response to a question, indicated he does not want to include it at this time. In response to a further question, Mr. Selby discussed his plans to re-side the house. Chairperson Drews cautioned Mr. Selby that significant changes to the historic nature of the structure may jeopardize the tax deferral status. Discussion took place regarding alterations to the property as

CARSON CITY HISTORIC ARCHITECTURE REVIEW COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 15, 2001 Meeting

Page 2

referenced in the recommended motion, and the language of the recommended motion. **Commissioner Smith moved to approve H-00/01-15 using the language presented by staff for this motion. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0-3-0.** Mr. Selby thanked the Commission.

F-2. H-00/01-16 A REQUEST FROM BLM FOR CONSIDERATION OF ADDING THE SILVER SADDLE RANCH TO THE CARSON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT (1-0240) - Gary Bowyer, Bureau of Land Management Archaeologist, displayed an aerial photograph of the Silver Saddle Ranch (the "Ranch") and referred to his April 26, 2001 letter included in the agenda materials. He pointed out the boundaries of the Ranch, provided historic information on the property, and discussed funding possibilities for restoration of the property and some of its amenities. He discussed the cooperative relationship between the BLM and the City to develop the Ranch, and reviewed various completed and ongoing projects. He reviewed portions of his April 26th letter with regard to BLM's acquisition of the Ranch. He advised that cultural resource studies have been done as mandated by the National Historic Preservation Act. The Army Corps of Engineers was involved in the cultural resource study because of a wetlands issue; however, prior to the report being submitted for review by the State Historic Preservation Office ("SHPO"), BLM acquired the property. Chairperson Drews provided information on a previous proposal by Landmark Homes to develop the Ranch.

Mr. Bowyer reiterated that the cultural resource study was never submitted to SHPO for review; however, the BLM received a copy and "had a good handle on what was out there." BLM staff sent a letter to SHPO advising that the survey phase of the project was adequate, however, recordation of the individual features, the buildings, etc. was inadequate with regard to evaluation of significance for those properties. Mr. Bowyer noted that the Ranch was not evaluated as a whole, but in individual components. The BLM is continuing the cultural resource study of the Ranch as a whole. Mr. Bowyer displayed copies of the individual recordings for the Chartz/Herlax Ranch, its buildings and ancillary structures, as well as for the Ulrich Ranch. He referred to the Interdisciplinary Management Plan developed by the BLM and displayed a copy of the same for the benefit of the Commissioners. A final draft was submitted to the SHPO, the Commission, and the City for comments. Mr. Bowyer acknowledged that a cultural resource management plan has yet to be prepared. He explained the purpose of the Interdisciplinary Management Plan and Chairperson Drews provided background information on its development. Mr. Bowyer and Chairperson Drews explained the purpose of the cultural resource management plan. Mr. Bowyer reviewed additions and changes to the Ulrich Ranch house and its associated structures, and discussed preliminary studies which have been conducted on the Chartz/Herlax Ranch house. Chairperson Drews advised that the Ulrich Ranch house has no architectural significance and that tearing it down will help to clean up the property and focus more of the attention on the culturally significant Chartz/Herlax Ranch house. Mr. Bowyer advised that the Ulrich Ranch house has been condemned.

Mr. Bowyer reviewed the issues identified during the Interdisciplinary Management Plan public hearing process. He discussed considerations for use of the ranch, including recreational opportunities, public health and safety, fire management, and preservation and protection of cultural resources. He reviewed and discussed objectives for preserving and protecting cultural resources, and noted that a specific cultural resource or preservation plan will address issues such as the frequency of maintenance activities and evaluation of the two Ranch houses. He acknowledged that the Ulrich house complex would be non-contributing to the historic district. If it is demolished, the historic features would be salvaged for use in the Chartz/Herlax house at some time in the future. Mr. Bowyer reviewed revisions to the Chartz/Herlax

CARSON CITY HISTORIC ARCHITECTURE REVIEW COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 15, 2001 Meeting

Page 3

house, but noted that the historic integrity is still intact. Discussion took place with regard to the possibility of accepting only the Chartz/Herlax buildings into the historic district, purview over the Mexican Ditch, and existing safety hazards. In response to a question, Mr. Bowyer advised that the Interdisciplinary Management Plan does not necessarily include a master plan for proposed new structures. He clarified that, in consultation with SHPO and prior to implementing the management plan, a single pit toilet was installed on the property. He described the structure, acknowledged that modern buildings have been constructed, but noted that their construction follows the design of the overall ranch setting. He discussed the possibility of kiosks in the future, and advised that a community picnic area is in the design stage. He indicated that BLM staff is attempting to “weave” some of the cultural resource into other management issues on the property. He advised that City staff has been helping to work on the wells.

He discussed advantages to adding the Ranch to the historic district, including available funding. He indicated that considerations for the BLM would include the Commission’s review process. Commissioner Ossa commented that the Ranch would be “a wonderful addition to the district just to have a breadth of variety of resources from archaeological buildings, ranches, landscapes, and so forth.” Chairperson Drews advised that the Commission’s requirements will be covered by §106 requirements. Ms. Pruitt suggested that one way to avoid a series of project reviews would be to introduce a master plan for approval by the Commission. Mr. Bowyer noted that §106 requires consultation with interested parties which would include the Commission by default. Discussion took place regarding advantages to adding the property to the historic district. Mr. Bowyer discussed an oral interview with the owner of the Ulrich house who lived on the property in the 1940s and 1950s, and advised of a scheduled interview with a member of the Herlax family.

Discussion took place with regard to the significance of the cultural resource management plan pertaining to review of projects by the Commission. Mr. Bowyer advised that there are plans to “do something” with the Ulrich house. He acknowledged he was not requesting the Commission to take action to add the Ranch to the historic district at this meeting. Commissioner Smith expressed a preference for including the Chartz/Herlax house and excluding the Ulrich house. He suggested that demolition of the Ulrich house complex take place prior to requesting inclusion of the Ranch in the historic district. Discussion took place with regard to the same and with regard to the benefits of adding the entire property to the historic district. Chairperson Drews suggested developing a memorandum of agreement between the BLM and the Commission. Mr. Bowyer concurred and expressed a preference for streamlining the review process. Commissioner Ossa pointed out that the BLM will be subject to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. Mr. Bowyer discussed preliminary estimates for repair and upgrade of the Chartz/Herlax house, and plans for a new structure at the location of the Ulrich house.

(1-1130) Pete Sinnott commented that tearing down the Ulrich house doesn’t fit with the purpose of requesting the Ranch property to be added to the historic district. He expressed the opinion that the outbuildings are not significant to the Ranch as they were added after the original structures were built. He compared the Silver Saddle Ranch with Rancho San Rafael in Reno. Discussion took place regarding the City’s involvement at the Ranch.

Chairperson Drews expressed the opinion that the Ranch would be a nice addition to the historic district. He expressed a preference for managing the Ranch according to a cultural resource management plan and a memorandum of agreement. Mr. Bowyer discussed plans to move a fence section to accommodate

CARSON CITY HISTORIC ARCHITECTURE REVIEW COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 15, 2001 Meeting

Page 4

wildlife access as an example of the BLM's need to consider overall management of the Ranch. Chairperson Drews reviewed the direction provided to Mr. Bowyer that the BLM develop a cultural resources management/treatment plan and a memorandum of agreement with the City and the Commission. Discussion took place with regard to the responsibility for preparing the management plan and memorandum of agreement. Commissioner Ossa agreed to contact Mr. Bowyer to cooperate in developing the documents. In response to a question, Mr. Bowyer advised that he would most likely not be returning to the Commission until the fall or winter. Commissioner Ossa referred to the Protocol Agreement between the BLM and SHPO, and Chairperson Drews pointed out that the proposal presented this evening incorporates a local element. Mr. Bowyer thanked the Commissioners. No formal action was taken.

F-3. H-00/01-17 A REQUEST FROM ROY FARROW, PROPERTY OWNER (PETE SINNOTT, APPLICANT), FOR APPROVAL OF PROPOSED LANDSCAPING WITHIN PUBLIC STREET RIGHT-OF-WAY, ADJACENT TO 310 MOUNTAIN STREET, APN 3-191-03 (1-1346) - Pete Sinnott, of Western Nevada Environments, reviewed the proposed design a rough sketch of which was included in the agenda materials. He described similar landscape designs in the area, the location and design of the house. Discussion took place regarding the possibility of setting a precedent, the non-historic value of the lawn, and the proposed landscape elements. Chairperson Drews requested a detailed landscape plan and photographs of the property. Mr. Sinnott requested a special meeting and Chairperson Drews indicated that a lunch meeting could be scheduled. Ms. Pruitt advised that she would contact Mr. Sinnott to schedule the meeting. No formal action was taken.

F-4. H-00/01-18 PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO TITLE 18, CHAPTER 7, HISTORIC DISTRICT ORDINANCE AMENDING THE TIME-FRAME FOR PUBLIC PROPERTY OWNER NOTICING FROM THREE TO FIVE DAY MINIMUM (1-1531) - Commissioner Smith moved to continue this item until a future date. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0-3-0.

G. FUTURE COMMISSION ITEMS (1-1556) - Commissioner Smith advised that he would be agendizing an item having to do with his property for the next meeting. He suggested reagendizing item F-4 for the June meeting. A brief discussion took place with regard to the Stewart Indian School and Chairperson Drews offered to draft a letter regarding the Commission's continued interest in a preservation plan. Commissioner Smith suggested agendizing discussion regarding a preservation plan for the June meeting and inviting Division of State Lands staff.

H. ADJOURNMENT (1-1635) - Commissioner Smith moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:01 p.m. Commissioner Baker seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

The Minutes of the May 15, 2001 meeting of the Carson City Historic Architecture Review Commission are so approved this _____ day of June, 2001.

MICHAEL DREWS, Chairperson